

Governing Views and Decision-Making of Art, Music, and Physical Education in Hawai'i

Jeremy T. Yeats, Ph.D.

Emi Tsuda, Ph.D.

James Wyant, Ph.D.

West Virginia University
United States

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to examine how Hawai'i's educational governance and structure influence decision-making regarding art, music, and physical education. A phenomenological case study design was employed. The lens of this study comes from three state-level governance members and 16 principals, who were recruited for this study. Semi-structured interviews were conducted with the participants which lasted 37-102 minutes and served as the primary data source. Creswell's (2007) case study analysis guidelines served as the umbrella framework for analysis. Governance members mentioned that they recognize the value of art, music, and physical education in the school curriculum to provide a well-rounded education to students. Further, these subject areas are an important vehicle to preserve the unique culture of Hawai'i. However, policies such as federal and state laws, mandates, guidelines, and programs make it difficult to offer classes in those subject areas. Federal and state decisions and limited resources for non-core subjects were also identified as barriers to offer and teach quality art, music, and physical education courses in Hawai'i. Analysis of participant data indicated links between art; music; and physical education; and critical cultural beliefs and traditions of the Hawai'i culture-sharing group. Given the data of this study, there is a contradiction with governance members' values towards academic subjects, since there is a clear discrepancy between value orientations and acting on those values.

Keywords: Educational governance, educational structure, educational policy

Introduction

During the time of the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) enforced in 2002, an emergent problem in the United States educational system was that art, music, and physical education were increasingly being taken out of the curriculum due to an overemphasis on core-academic subject areas (e.g., English language arts and literacy, history/social studies; science, and math) (Giambo, 2010; Graham et al., 2002; Robelen, 2010; Woodside-Jiron & Gehsmann, 2009). One of the significant features of NCLB, stronger accountability for results and added pressure for states to close students' achievement gaps, fueled this problem (U.S. Department of Education, 2004).

As a part of accountability, report cards were required to inform parents and communities about state and school district progress. Schools which failed to make adequate yearly progress were labeled by their State Department of Education as being 'in need of improvement' (Woodside-Jiron & Gehsmann, 2009). Schools that did not meet adequate yearly progress were required to provide supplemental services (free tutoring and after-school assistance); importantly, if a school still did not make adequate progress after five years, dramatic changes would be considered as potential consequences, such as school closure (U.S. Department of Education, 2011). It was within this climate that teachers started spending less time on non-core curriculum items, which afforded teachers added time to prepare

students for NCLB-mandated high-stakes tests (Graham et al., 2002). In some instances, this shift of curricular focuses caused breaking educational laws. For example, in Massachusetts, the law states that all students of all grades must be taught physical education; however, with the core curriculum focus, some schools no longer had physical education at certain grade levels (Coleman, 2001).

Emphasis on core-academic subject areas also impacted budget cuts for non-core academic subject areas, which increased further threats for reductions and elimination of art, music, and physical education (Coleman, 2001; Graham et al., 2002; Stretcher & Barron, 1999). For example, in Rochester, New York, a school board analysis of the Rochester City School District claimed they had a \$76.5 million deficit, and the introduction of the NCLB caused cutting a total of 908 foreign language, art, music, and physical education teachers (Barnhart, 2011). The proportion of art, music, and physical education teachers who were to lose their jobs was 42%, 46%, and 19%, respectively. Another school board in Pottstown, Pennsylvania, reduced teachers of the library, art, music, and physical education by 65% of their current total, saving a total amount of \$320,444, which was needed to make up for a 15% cut in federal funding for reading programs (Brandt, 2011). A similar issue was seen in Ohio (Mears, 2010).

The policies that have created this erosion were problematic because researchers have shown that students who are taught a well-rounded education demonstrate positive social-emotional, intellectual, and behavioral development (Grauerholz, 2001; Malone, 2008). For instance, through art, vast amounts of multicultural knowledge and skills can be learned including diversity, equity, and social justice (Kraehe, 2010; McFee & Degge 1977). Regarding music, Burnsed stated, "Just playing the music informally will enhance the atmosphere of the classroom" (1993, p. 103). The research also found that integrating music in curriculum enhanced students' self-esteem and attitude towards school (Mark, 1986). Further, regular participation in physical education is important to tackle health challenges, such as obesity, heart disease, and mental health (Carlson et al., 2008; Tremarche, Robinson, & Graham, 2007). There is also evidence that physically active/fit youth are more likely to have better grades and test scores than their inactive counterparts (Trost & van der Mars, 2010). As such, non-core academic subject areas are vital to enhancing not only the academic intelligence of students but also multiple aspects of students' growth.

The NCLB act was considered a "top-down" or a behavioristic approach and affects each state differently (Tinning, 2006). The threat to art, music, and physical education turned to be especially a bigger issue in states that are low-funded in education, for instance, the state of Hawai'i (Graham et al., 2002). The State of Hawai'i had a \$1.1 billion deficit in the state education budget in 2009. With the enforcement of NCLB, the state also had to introduce 17 unpaid days off (furlough days) in 2009 and 2010 (Quillen, 2009). Further, before the application of NCLB, there were no requirements at any school level as for art and music, students could take these classes as electives (Hawai'i Department of Education [HIDOE], 2006). However, after NCLB, the State of Hawai'i decided to increase graduation requirements for math which resulted in decreasing the number of elective credits taken, which impacted the number of art and music classes that students could acquire (RMC Research Corporation, 2011). The reduction of non-core academic subject areas in the State of Hawai'i was accelerated due to the fact that Hawai'i has been under the national average in reading and math for both 4th and 8th graders since 1992 (National Center for Education Statistics, 2011).

Reducing the time for non-core academic subject areas from the curriculum at schools is a significant problem in Hawai'i due to the unique challenges of children and youth in the state. For instance, since 2006, there has been an escalation of youth violence in a large geographic-school complex in southeastern rural Hawai'i, which is related to the loss of strong cultural connections (Affonso et al., 2010). Also, health-disparity is a significant issue in the state. Hawai'i has a diverse population, and the life expectancy for a native Hawai'ian is the lowest of any other ethnic group in the state. Among various issues, obesity and being overweight are leading factors as they contribute to other diseases causing the lowest life expectancy. The overall numbers for the state of Hawai'i for youths (age 10-17) are 25.5% for overweight and obese, whereas adult diabetes rates are at 10.5% (State of Obesity, 2017). The real concern is with the Native Hawai'ian and Pacific Islanders as adults have a 34.6% obesity and 26.8% overweight rate (The Office of Minority Health, 2017). For Native Hawai'ian and Pacific Islander adolescents, 7.5% and 22.8% are obese and overweight, respectively (The Office of Minority Health, 2017). Not only are there extreme physical risks, but there are mental health issues in native Hawai'ians.

Native American elders, activists, social workers, mental health professionals, and scholars nationwide were trying to revitalize cultural traditions and combat problems of alcoholism, drug abuse, suicide, and mental illness, which were all symptoms of historical trauma (Heart & Deschenie, 2006). Children and youth in the State of Hawai'i face challenges psychologically and physically.

Although not all populations in Hawai'i were suffering to the same extent for these challenges, all populations could be helped through quality art, music, and physical education programs in schools. This is especially true in Hawai'i since their culture is unique in a way that their curriculum is afflicted with colonialism, which has been an issue in the schools over a hundred years ago, compared to other states in the United States. Kaomea (2000) reported the incident that underrepresented racial and ethnic groups (like the Hawai'ians) in American society lobby school boards and textbook companies to be represented in the curriculum. As a native Hawai'ian, people wanted to see themselves, their people, and their culture included and represented in the curriculum.

It is evident that the challenges that the people in Hawai'i face is not limited to academic challenges, and the need of continually providing art, music, and physical education at schools to serve children and youth in the state is clear. Quality culturally responsive art and music programs in the schools would be a way to have appropriate services, which would align the curriculum to the needs of the Hawai'i culture-sharing group. Thus, examining the impact of government decisions to the state level and perceptions of governance at the state level is critical to consider the potential implication of educational shifts at the national level for individuals within each state in the United States.

The purpose of this study was to examine Hawai'i's educational governance and structure, and understand how these systems impacted decision-making and policy regarding art, music, and physical education. Two research questions were explored in the study: (a) What are the perceptions of the impacts of Hawai'i's educational governance on art, music, and physical education? (b) What are the perceptions and the values of governance members toward art, music, and physical education in Hawai'i?

Educational System in Hawai'i

The State of Hawai'i consists of eight different islands. The general population inhabits a total of six islands, and individual islands and groups of islands make up their own counties. People of Hawai'ian descent inhabited one island strictly, and another island was uninhabited due to military testing. The unique school system was divided into seven district offices throughout the state, which consisted of Hawai'i office (the island of Hawai'i), Kaua'i office (islands of Kaua'i and Ni'ihau), Maui office (islands of Maui, Moloka'i, and Lana'i), and four offices on the island of Oahu (Honolulu district, Central district, Leeward district, and Windward office). The structures that create and enact policy have geographical barriers, in the form of oceans between the islands. This isolation makes engagement in policy decisions and enactment expensive, time-consuming, and in certain areas, impossible to receive the resources, guidance, and communication from governance members that they need. The stratification of and allegiance to cultures compounds the issue even further, and communication between cultures is often purposefully misleading.

The Department of Education in Hawai'i manages the statewide systems of public schools (Marumoto, 2007). The Board of Education formulates policy and manages the public-school systems through its executive members, the state superintendent, and state librarian. The Superintendent is the chief executive officer of the public-school system. The Superintendent has the power to appoint a leadership team, which is made up of the Deputy Superintendent, and Executive Assistant, five state-level Assistant Superintendents. The Superintendent also appoints fifteen Complex Area Superintendents (nine on Oahu, three on the island of Hawai'i, two on Maui, and one on Kauai who presides over and supports the schools in their respective areas). The Office of the Superintendent also includes a Systems Accountability Office, Communications Office, Civil Rights Compliance Office, and Program Support and Development. Many of the offices connected with the Superintendent are concerned with facilities, human resources, budgets, and technology; however, the office of curriculum, instruction, and student support has the capacity to work directly with the schools.

Method

The study employed the combined phenomenology and case study, which were termed a phenomenological case study (Creswell, 2007). The study design was appropriate since the erosion of curricular space for art, music, and physical education was a national phenomenon because all states, counties, and districts were so individualized, the only way to properly address the problem was through the selection of an identified bound case. Prior to the initiation of the study, the Institutional Review Board approval was obtained and appropriate consents were solicited from participants.

Setting

The study was implemented in the State of Hawai'i. With the enforcement of NCLB, the State of Hawai'i was elected to increase graduation requirements for math. Hawai'i created a new high school diploma (with an additional credit of a senior project), synthesized Common Core standards for mathematics, opened STEM academies/courses, and increased assessments in STEM-related fields. At the time of the study, there were no requirements for art, music and physical education at any school level in these subjects (HIDOE, 2006), and thus, due to those changes in STEM courses, the number of elective credits taken were decreased (Research Making Chance [RMC] Research Corporation, 2011). Physical education in the early 2000s in the State of Hawai'i had a one-credit graduation requirement (HIDOE, 2006). However, at the time of the study, there was only a half-credit requirement for standard physical education and a half-credit requirement for P.E. lifetime fitness. In Hawai'i, there is a mandate for at least 30 minutes of physical education per week in grades K-6, and there are no physical education mandate minutes for middle/intermediate schools. Hawai'i has robust performance standards for music, art, and physical education at the elementary and middle school levels. However, these are only guidelines, and there is no governing body that evaluates compliance (HIDOE, 2006).

Participants

Purposeful and snowball sampling methods were used to recruit participants. A total of three State-Level Governance members and 16 principals (5.5% of the total principals in Hawai'i [16/293]) (elementary $n = 8$; middle school $n = 5$; high school $n = 3$) participated in the study. A wide range of cultural backgrounds was represented within the participants, with heritage and backgrounds ranging from Oceania, Asia, Europe, and the mainland U.S. All participants were given (with the option to choose) pseudonyms to protect their anonymity. Additional information on the governance members' pseudonyms, positions, and gender can be found in Table 1.

Table 1. Demographic information of the participants

Positions	Gender	Governance Member Pseudonym
State-Level Governance Member	Female	Keiko, Lei
	Male	Bear
Elementary School Principal	Female	Nimiko, Yoshizaki, Janeiro, Pamela, Danica
	Male	Sam, Farley, Bobby
Middle School Principal	Female	Glorietta, Daphne, Sefulu
	Male	Jose
Intermediate School Principal	Male	Tom
High School Principal	Male	Dr. Barnes, Mr. Akamai
High School Principal/Ex-State Superintendent	Male	Daisuke

Data Sources

Three sources of data were collected for the study: semi-structured interviews, supporting policy documents and artifacts, and researcher's journals. The data of the interviews served as the primary data source, and other data were used to support the shared interview comments of the participants.

Interview. A semi-structured interview which included 32 questions was conducted in the study. The purposes of the interviews were to (a) gain an understanding of the historical and cultural background of the participant, (b) to construct knowledge with each other based on prior learning and a transfer of that knowledge, (c) to understand their values of art, music, and physical education, and (d) to examine their decision-making regarding art, music, and physical education. Each governance member interviews were 37-102 minutes in length and face-to-face at a predetermined location agreed upon by the participant and the researcher. One interview took place at a coffee shop, and all the other interviews occurred on the school grounds in the principal's office. All interviews were audiotaped and transcribed verbatim. There were 1,139 minutes of interview data used in this study.

Supporting policy documents and artifacts. Governance members provided supporting evidence related to their decisions and perceptions of policy. Documents collected from schools, principals, and policymakers included teacher contracts, piloted health programs, letters to Washington, DC, to keep performing arts learning centers, art in public places documents, copies of acts, copies of board policies, letters to Department of Education to keep physical education, and graduation requirements. These document sources supported the understanding of the governance members' perceptions.

Researcher's journal. The role of the researcher's journal was to document thoughts, feelings, and perceptions of the researcher throughout the study. The thoughts, feelings, and perceptions must be viewed through the researcher's subjectivities during and after the study as a form of researcher reflexivity (Creswell, 2007). In addition to the researcher's subjectivity statement and reflexivity during the study, the researcher's journal captured reflections of the research process and reflections of the data collection process, collected data, and data analysis.

Reflections of the researcher's journal have transformed into reflections per island (according to which island I visited first: Island #1, Island #2, and Island #3) and islands he did not visit (Island #4 and Island #5), and reflections of the overall experience. The island pseudonyms were named by numbers to ensure anonymity. Also, these pseudonyms were a constant reminder that the perceptions of the principals were that there was an island that was more important than all of the others, and many perceived issues arose from this viewpoint. The structure of the reflections came out because each islands' foci, culture, atmosphere, and lifestyle were completely different.

Data Analysis

Governance member interviews were analyzed using Creswell's (2007) template for analyzing case study research. The structure of Creswell's framework was as follows: case context, case description, within-case theme analysis, and assertions and generalizations. Assertions and generalizations have been added to the discussion and conclusion sections.

Case context. To generate an in-depth portrait of the educational governance system in Hawai'i and to describe the governance members' decision-making processes about art, music, and physical education, one must describe the case context first (Creswell, 2007). The circumstances around the educational structure and governance in Hawai'i were described in terms that would make them fully understood by the reader. The only way to do so was to have all of the governance members' perceptions side-by-side to generate a setting of the educational structure/governance in Hawai'i. This started with the governance members and organizations that were interviewed, which were the board of education, department of education, special interest group organizations, and principals.

Case description. A thick description (detail, context, emotion, and the webs of social networks; Creswell, 2007) of the case of the State of Hawai'i's educational structure, governance, and decisions regarding art, music, and physical education was developed by the lead researcher. The description started with perceptions of the governance members at the top of the educational structure (board of education, department of education, and special interest group organizations). Next, K-12 principals' perspectives on art, music, physical educations, their values and future hopes for these subjects, and policies that were impacting these subjects were also shared.

Within-case theme analysis. The themes that were coded (by the creation of themes stemming from meaning units) through the descriptions of the case and context were then created and analyzed (Creswell, 2007). Since analysis and data collection were concurrent within the qualitative inquiry, the tentative creation of emergent themes was the focus since the first day of phase 1 data collection. The researcher's journal and daily reflections were the first steps in synthesizing the major findings of this study. Upon completion of all of the governance interviews, the

interviews were transcribed one-by-one. During this phase, the researcher highlighted critical meaning units that potentially would be able to fit in the emergent themes.

The within-case theme analysis used for data analysis, and participants' responses to individual interview questions were analyzed using two distinct yet overlapping processes of analysis derived from a grounded theoretical perspective: open and axial coding (Strauss & Corbin, 2008). Open coding was the process of developing categories of concepts and themes derived from the data. In this study, open coding was used to analyze interview transcripts, daily activity logs, and additional school artifacts by reviewing each multiple time and making notes in the margins of the documents about their possible meaning. Additionally, open coding involved the process of conceptualizing, defining categories, and developing categories of results in terms of their properties and dimensions.

Axial coding facilitated building connections within categories. In this phase, the goal was to systematically develop and relate categories. This step included the process of sorting out the relationships between concepts and sub-concepts with the ultimate goal to discover the ways that categories related to each other. Through the axial coding process, the researcher's goal was to answer questions of who, when, where, why, how, and with what consequences (Strauss & Corbin, 2008). Two levels of highlighting/coding were adopted. One set of highlights (green highlights) was used for the information I thought to be the most important parts of the study. The other set of highlights (yellow highlights) was critical information that was apparent through multiple governance members' perceptions. The meaning units in green highlights were analyzed first, with a new analysis system generated from possible themes outlined by the researcher's journal, reflections of the researcher's journal, and researcher's field notes. These initial themes now had supporting evidence from the interview transcriptions. Next, these tentative themes were cross-examined by an expert/peer reviewer. Suggestions were made and a new set of potential themes and sub-themes emerged.

The next step was to analyze the other set of meaning units (yellow highlights) and review the green highlights while being aware of possible additional themes and sub-themes that may emerge, to find supporting evidence of the existing themes and sub-themes, and to relate the themes back to the research questions as well as the case context and case description. As a part of this additional review step, all of the meaning units and parts of the entire interview transcriptions were organized again to depict educational governance and structure in Hawai'i; decision making based on the governance members' work and personal background; perceptions of community and culture; and perceptions, values, and reasons for valuing art, music, and physical education. Upon completion of this analysis, all of the interviews in their entirety were reviewed a final time to make sure critical features and support of themes and sub-themes were not dismissed, as well as to ensure confidentiality. Final changes to the themes and sub-themes were made and another round of expert examination of the themes occurred.

Trustworthiness, Building Rapport, and Ethics

The trustworthiness of the data was established by triangulation of the data, member checking, peer examination, expert examination, and the inclusion of researcher's biases were also employed (Creswell, 2007). Triangulation was established by collecting multiple data sources. The data sources included interview data, shared documents and artifacts, and a researcher's journal. Peer examination was executed by having other researchers examine the data and analysis to address the confirmability of the study (Merriam, 2009). Interview transcriptions were given back to all participants, which provided them the opportunity to ensure their messages reflected what they were trying to convey and add anything else that they missed to their responses. Also, the final analysis was returned to the participants so that they could have some final say in the study (Creswell, 2007).

Building rapport and maintaining neutrality were both stances that an interviewer must understand to be successful in an interview. Rapport is a stance relating to the person being interviewed (Merriam, 2009). Some ways to build rapport with interviewee include explaining one's motives and intentions in the study, discussion of anonymity with them, giving them a role as a member check and by having some final say in the study's content, and the maintenance of a neutral stance (Taylor & Bogdan, 1984). These issues were discussed prior to the actual interview beginning, and researcher's journal entries helped the researcher maintain a neutral stance while having multiple member checks gave the participants multiple chances to have the final say in the study.

Results

Four recurring themes emerged from the data: (a) The impact of federal and state government decisions on non-core academic subject areas, (b) the limited resources for non-core academic subject areas, (c) non-core academic

subject areas as critical tools of transmitting culture, and (d) discrepancies between people's value orientations and reality.

Theme 1: The Impact of Federal and State Government Decisions

Values and beliefs as to what was important in education have been and still are varied, but at the top levels of governance, the core curriculum was valued most, and particularly math and science, over other core areas. State-level Governance Member Bear explained why art, music, and physical education was not a high priority because there is a limited budget. He said that "There is a push for student achievement because academically our students are struggling. The truth of the matter is that our students have not achieved well academically, they are not ready for careers and college." Bear explained further that increasing the standards (in core areas) would allow Hawai'i to be more competitive with their peers nationally and globally. Principals also noticed this, on Island #1, Barnes, a State-Level Governance member, mentioned that NCLB hurts art, music, and physical education because there was more emphasis on the core, common core, and the other subjects got left behind. Barnes said:

If a child is not performing in math, then he is going to have a double dose of math, and that time is going to come from somewhere, you know, and so I think that is what a lot of people were afraid of, and it has happened to some extent, that there is not as much emphasis on those other areas, because there is more of a focus on the core.

Bear explained further that increasing the standards (in core areas) would allow Hawai'i to be more competitive with their peers nationally and globally. Another State-level Governance Member, Lani, also shared her perception that the focus of education in Hawai'i was about the test (Hawai'i State Assessment). Principal Janeiro further added, "The present educational structure doesn't provide much for elementary schools to provide (art, music, and physical education); however, in secondary schools, the minimum requirement is insufficient, which is down to one year in high school." The shift toward core-academic subject areas resulted in reducing curricular space for non-core academic subject areas in the State of Hawai'i.

Due to NCLB, a governance member from Island #3 pointed out that the educational system was running like a business. Richard focused on how the political rhetoric of the state was focusing on college and career ready students:

We walk, eat, breathe GLOs (General Learning Outcomes), as a matter of fact, when you look at a kid's report card... the first sheet of the report card is how well has the child achieved the GLOs. The second sheet of their report card is, how did they do with their grades. So, there is an infusion, but when you look at college and career ready, businesses subscribe to the concept of the GLOs... because of the quality of work. How I could contribute to the community at large, how does a worker become productive, from the college side of it they want their kids to be able to demonstrate the importance of quality producing, they want to see what is your product, what is your product going to look like.

The product model was reminiscent of a factory line, creating students who would then become workers of the factory.

Excessive focus on the core subject has left governance members with decisions on what non-core subjects were most valuable and needed to be kept. While Barnes saw people valuing subjects, such as physical education, but stated that the current graduation requirement (one credit) did not serve high school students. The governance members expressed similar difficulties for art and music. To confront this challenge, governance members in Hawai'i believed the integration of non-core subjects into core subjects, and vice versa was the only current option to include more art, music, and physical education. Principal Daisuke said, "it (education) can't be in silos, but it has to be integrated." Lei also suggested that "we need to look at other ways that kids learn and other things that are important," and also reminded people how important it was to be innovative and creative.

Theme 2: The Limited Resources for Non-Core Academic Subject Areas

The limited financial and teacher resources for non-core academic subject areas were pointed out by the participants as one of the challenges for securing curricula space for art, music, and physical education. Although Hawai'i did not receive much funding from the local level, it receives much more at the state level compared to other states. Thus, when there is a cut in state funding, the school systems in Hawai'i had significant impacts.

Lei, a State-level Governance Member, provided insight on how limited funding influenced a state-mandated program in the arts (the Hawai'i Arts Alliance [HAA]). She specified how even though the HAA was mandated by law; no official budget had been allocated right away. Lei further described how the federal government now funds around 30%, while the state funds 25%. Thus, the people within their HAA organization have gone after grants and fundraised monies to fund the HAA programs, which were getting more competitive. Also, Principal Jose claimed that the funding cuts made it difficult to fund band equipment costs, especially since the equipment was so costly to replace or repair. The lack of budgets also impacted physical spaces to execute non-core academic subject areas such as physical spaces for gymnasiums, and spaces for art, music, and performance. Principal Sam shared that most schools do not have gymnasiums.

Keiko, a State-level Governance Member, gave further insight into NCLB funding. She detailed how visual arts were included under the NCLB act; however, music and physical education are not included. As a result, the NCLB federal funds may not be leveraged to support these programs. Keiko reiterated that the State of Hawai'i was committed to reinforce national standards and assessments that are tied to them.

The challenges of funding were further complicated due to unevenly distributed resources. Principal Danica commented on the weighted student formula (a formula that provides a different amount of funding depending on students' needs), stating:

The formula has recently changed, our dilemma at this particular school is the geographical issues. When they are looking at weighted student formula, they are looking at English Language Learners, economic background, etc. If you took the exact same demographics and plopped them in the middle of the schools in the city on Island #1, the needs that needed to be met, could be met through community resources. Whatever it is, we don't have the community resources, so I think that is one drawback to weighted student formula. Should we get more money because we have more difficult needs to be met?

Even though the weighted student formula was supposed to be a positive change, for this school it presented a new set of problems.

The budget cuts also impacted ways to secure human resources to deliver non-core academic subject areas in the state. Principal Glorietta mentioned that if the deficit was that severe, she would have to cut more positions. She would cut something that she could cut and saw art, music, and physical education as the most likely areas to target.

The challenges of securing human resources were not limited due to financial challenges. Hawai'i's teachers have been faced with many barriers that are unique to the state. Teachers have dealt with the shortest school day in the nation. A teacher shortage has prevented schools from retaining qualified teachers, and this has created a revolving door of teachers from the mainland. This "revolving door" of teachers, especially impacted music education. Principal Danica, on Island #3, provided insight into how difficult it was to find band teachers in her rural area.

It is hard to find band instructors, so once a band teacher leaves, it is not like you can just get a new band instructor, and that is not a position that you can just get a substitute for. So, our school has a beautiful band building, but when the last person left, we weren't able to fill that slot, so we found another teacher that has experience in singing and chorus, and we got her to teach an ensemble class, along with her other job duties. So, it evolves over the years based on the money and personnel pieces. If you can't fill all of your positions, then you are going to first fill your required positions, and then you look at your electives, and music is an elective.

Having someone who has experience in singing and chorus is not the same as having a qualified music teacher. Despite having facilities and musical instruments/equipment, this school is unable to offer chorus and band classes on a consistent basis.

Principal Glorietta also had concerns for her students, because when they transition from middle school to high school there is not really a (music) program to follow. She spoke more on how the high school has not been able to carry out a full band position. Glorietta went on to describe the current qualifications of the high school teachers:

The past two years, the people that have been teaching the program were not certified in the band, but because of the teaching positions, this past year, the line is a little of a mix . . . but they had an English teacher teach band, now her background is more English . . . she does know, on her own she does know how to do the Hula, play the ukulele, and so my teacher offered from his end to kind of help the teacher on that end by doing after school programs, inviting the children over, but I am thinking, yeah, you know, that is good, I don't mind doing that, but now I am getting selfish, I am thinking, OK, so to what cost?

Glorietta noted that finding the right people to teach certain classes is a real barrier. Many times, she ends up conducting phone interviews for the positions, since they could not afford to fly them in from the mainland U.S., and she says everyone gives their best responses. Glorietta said "they will give you the responses you want, and then sometimes, not all of the time, they come here, and you think, oh my goodness. So, if I could find the right people, and keep the right people, keep them here, then I think it would work." As such, there was desperation to find ways to get quality people to her school and be able to retain them.

Theme 3: Non-Core Academic Subject Areas as Critical Tools of Transmitting Culture

Hawai'i is a rich melting pot of world cultures, and within the State, each island has its own distinct culture. Principal Richard mentioned how he had spent time on the U.S. mainland, and in Hawai'i, as he was growing up. He detailed his experiences of culture shock within the State of Hawai'i:

I would be turning it (pidgin, the Creole language of Hawai'i) on and off, so for me it wasn't hard of an adjustment at all, coming back to the island. What I did notice was coming back to [Island #1] and [Island #3], because there are two different kinds of cultures, they might be in Hawai'i, but the point is how the locals think and act on one island is different than they act on another island, and [Island #2] is another example, and [Island #4]. So they all have their own unique ways of communication, the pigeon (local English dialect which incorporates words from many other cultures) is different.

During data collection, numerous researcher journal entries were made which supported this statement. Examples include, "Island #2 was noticeably more hostile and violent, where locals on Island #3 were much more welcoming," and "On Island #2 food is called "mops," whereas on Island #3 food is "grinds."

The cultural diversity and the positive interactions with people of different backgrounds and ethnicities was a strength of the region. Thus, Hawai'i could incorporate artwork, music and dance, and physical activity and sport from all around the world into their lifestyles. Keiko, a State-Governance member, disclosed that she believed art and music in the State of Hawai'i are a means for expressing oneself and one's culture. Bear concurred and gave details on how music is valued tremendously and is part of our whole culture:

Music education in Hawai'i is "valued tremendously, it is part of our whole culture, and it is part of everyone's culture. It is valued by the community, I mean we celebrate events by music year around, and the more people that are encouraged to learn to play, I think that it enhances their quality of life.

Lani also stated that "I value music because I have a background in music. . .culturally it's really important as a means to bring people together and celebrate their cultures." It is evident through the analysis of the data across all levels of governance art, music, and physical education are important tools for transmitting culture in Hawai'i. The values of communities on different islands varied immensely. Some islands valued hunting, farming, surfing, bodyboarding, and rodeo. On other islands, there was a need for better vocational services such as construction, auto shop, and graphic arts; while some islands had a lot of support for arts from both local and transplant populations. The extreme differences in values on each island demonstrated how the communities use non-core subject areas to transmit the culture of their island.

The songs, dances, murals, culinary arts, paddling, physical training, and languages of Hawai'i all contribute to make the state's whole culture. The cultural diversity is so rich, that it can bring everyone together to celebrate their different backgrounds. Hawai'i incorporates artwork, music, and physical activity from around the world. Members of the governance structure from every level view art, music, and physical education as a very important way of transmitting their culture to future generations.

Theme 4: Discrepancies between People's Value Orientations and Reality

Regardless of the challenges that they face, the State Governance members consistently claimed positive perspectives in art, music, and physical education. However, they also shared how their values were not always reflected in the curriculum that they teach. For example, a State Governance member, Lei, said "I think it (art education) is a wonderful avenue for students to come to the table of learning. For me it's a way to be equitable because it opens the door for children to come in when they normally wouldn't." Sam, a Principal, also said: "I value art because a life without art is less rich and vital." Similarly, positive value toward music was consistently shared by the participants. A principal, Namiko, shared that:

Music is really the integration of logic and creativity, and it's a very important part of education and learning classes for the kids. It just activates all parts of your brain. It helps you in every aspect from logic to emotional balance, as well as music in terms of being part of a community.

Bear, a State-Governance member, and Tom, a principal, also discussed the value of music for child development.

About physical education, Glorietta stated that "I value physical education because I am thinking when you look at what is going on in our nation, you talk about obesity, and the food choices, and everything, and I am looking at the children, and it bothers me that all they do is just kind of sit." Janeiro, another principal, added:

Physical education/sports are equally as important because physical activity generates oxygen to the brain which helps with student achievement. It helps minimize obesity and reduces bodily ailments such as high blood pressure and breathing and heart problems. Like music, it brings joy to one's soul through dance which helps us to be physically fit and brings people together when they do dance routines that involve a group activity.

Like this, both the state-level governance member group and K-12 governance member group has expressed how art, music, and physical education is tremendously valued in Hawai'i.

However, the participants also pointed out that not many people were not acting on these values, particularly at levels that make policy decisions. A state-level governance member advocating for the arts mentioned how statewide, there is a lack of art at the elementary school level. A Principal, Namiko, said that "Art education in Hawai'i I can't speak for. At my school, we do try to infuse in different activities. Of the three areas (art, music, and physical education) this an area that we really haven't paid much attention to." Farley added that "(music) courses are kind of under attack, because of different graduation requirements." Similarly, the principals have expressed concern of very little structure regarding music education. Janeiro shared that "My perception of music education in the State of Hawai'i is that it has been compromised due to all of the high stakes testing that schools are faced with to pass the Hawai'i State Assessment in reading and math. Teachers often reduce or cut their music time to include more time for reading and math lessons."

The participants also described physical education in the same way as art and music education. Despite their expressed values, policies and practice are impacting physical education in a detrimental way across the state. The K-12 graduation requirements have reduced the required credits from physical education and health. Physical education teacher education within the state has also been reduced in the state's universities. Bear, a State-Governance, commented that:

Physical Education in Hawai'i is not a high priority, because the reality is there is only so much money to go around. There is a push for student achievement because academically our students are struggling.

The participants described the possibilities with art, music, and physical education, but overall, they explained that their values towards those academic subject areas are not reflected in their curriculum.

Discussion

The purpose of this study was to examine Hawai'i's educational governance and structure and determine how these systems impacted decision-making and their perceptions regarding art, music, and physical education. The results of the data analyses generated four themes: (a) The impact of federal and state government decisions on non-core academic subject areas, (b) the limited resources for Non-core academic subject areas, (c) non-core academic subject areas as critical tools of transmitting culture, and (d) discrepancies between people's value orientations and reality.

Based on the results from the themes and sub-themes of this study, there were some specific policy conclusions made. The participants mentioned that the federal No Child Left Behind policy impacted the state by having a big focus on meeting grade level outcomes and adequate yearly progress. Moreover, the funds from NCLB couldn't be leveraged to support all academic subjects. These factors demonstrated how State and Federal decisions inhibited the quality of art, music, and physical education in Hawai'i. Principals in this study also mentioned how Act 51, which created a weighted student formula, triggered smaller budgets and less resources for art, music, and physical education by not having their old allotments and having much higher funding necessities for students with more needs. Also, although Act 306/01 created the ARTS First Strategic plan, there were still limited resources for the Hawai'i Arts Alliance to use, as State and Federal funding only provided them with 55% of their necessary budget. Discrepancies between governance members' values supporting art, music, and physical education and the policy environment also were revealed in this study. For example, Board Policy 4540 on Graduation Requirements lowered the number of required electives, which lowered the number of art, music, and physical education classes that could be selected by high school students. The perceptions of the governance members detail that policy and decision-making has created fundamental curricular issues in Hawai'i.

The results revealed fundamental curricular issues of "top-down approaches", which was also considered as one of the characteristics of the NCLB act (Tinning, 2006). Due to the introduction of NCLB, a clear focus was placed on core-academic subject areas to perform well on standardized testing to stay eligible for funding, and curriculum erosion was observed in non-core academic subject areas. However, according to the previous literature, top-down nor bottom-up approaches are not suggested for state-wide change (Aronson et al., 2005; Chrispeels & Gonzalez, 2006; Darling-Hammond et al., 2006; Grix, 2010). Instead, Darling-Hammond et al. (2006) suggested an "inside-out and outside-in" approach. This approach seeks to empower teachers and principals through intensive professional development, and shared norms of practice from the "top" and "bottom," at the same time. The new perspective was to address "outside" policies and used them in a constructive manner focused on "inside" purposes; therefore, not deflecting their force of momentum. Other systemic change models have stressed simultaneous changes at all levels, Chrispeels and Gonzalez (2006) advocated for a change to occur concurrently at the district, school, classroom, student, and community levels. Shared beliefs and a whole-system perspective by all the members in the community are needed.

To confront this challenge, governance members in this study stressed how importance of an integrated curriculum. The benefits of integration were found in Robinson's (2013) meta-analysis. Robinson (2013) examined 453 studies conducted between 1995 and 2011 examining the use of arts integration with disadvantaged students. With this critique of a large sum of research, interpretations included arts-integrated instruction developing "metacognition, which bi-directionally influences cognitive processing skills, content knowledge, perseverance, and self-efficacy (Robinson, 2013, p. 201)."

The shift of focus at the government level directly impacted financial and human resources in the school systems in Hawai'i. The lack of quality teachers, financial resources, and time in the school day make art and physical education classes difficult to fit in the curriculum within the state (Lounsbury, McKenzie, Trost, & Smith, 2011). Further, lack of administrative and collegial support, lack of equipment, poor facilities, large class sizes, philosophical and curricular differences, and marginalization of subject matter, were also identified as barriers (Prusak, Pennington, Graser, Beighle, & Morgan, 2010). These issues were greatly related to the focus in the NCLB act. In order for a state to get funding, many systems are primarily teaching to the test of core-academic subject areas (Guifoyle, 2006). However, quality teachers understand, perhaps intuitively, that in order to achieve deep, lasting learning, students need to be engaged on many levels (Grauerholz, 2001).

Members of the governance structure from every level viewed art, music, and physical education as a way of transmitting their culture to future generations. With all the other barriers to art, music, and physical education across the state, it is easy to see how "more important priorities." Such prioritization is putting art, music, and physical education at risk of being eradicated from the curriculum. The erosion of these subjects is essentially the extinction of many critical cultural beliefs and traditions. Hawai'i must come together, stand up for their future generations' cultural heritage, and promote art, music, and physical education across the state more than ever before. The cultural richness of each island and each community is a huge benefit that also can be harnessed, especially through art, music, and physical education.

Educational governance members across the state described their values and perceptions of art, music, and physical education during this study. The perceptions from K-12 governance members; however, did not corroborate with policy implementation leading to positive changes for the non-core subjects examined in this study, across the state. It was difficult for the state to support all non-core subjects, as Keiko reiterated that physical education and music are not included under the NCLB legislation, so no NCLB federal funds can be used to support those academic programs. Additionally, State-Governance Member Keiko stressed that Hawai'i is focused on national standards and assessments tied to them. It is important that the perceptions and intentions of impacting art, music, and physical education in a positive way to match the policies, structures, and decision-making that occur. Curriculum policy in Hawai'i and other states should consider other curriculum traditions. Considering curriculum as a rational system, policies are the starting point to implement new content ideas to concurrently impact curriculum and instruction, and to change what teachers and students know, what they believe, and what they choose to work on together (Elmore & Sykes, 1992).

Decisions made for the whole state are not being driven by local needs and necessities. The one state system makes it very difficult to meet individual needs on individual islands and differing school systems. By understanding the intricacies of local areas, schools would be able to better meet the needs of their art, music, and physical education programs. There is no clear communication path among all members of the system. In the future, Hawai'i must communicate at all levels or the entire education structure is jeopardized-not just art, music, and physical education. Stratification and cultures of different islands make communication much more difficult in Hawai'i, and so shared beliefs and a whole-system perspective by all the members in the community are needed (Chrispeels & Gonzalez, 2006; Darling-Hammond et al., 2006).

Limitations and Future Directions

The major limitation of the study was the lack of state-level governance participation. Examining the inner workings of Hawai'i's Board of Education, and the Department of Education and superintendents could have allowed us to compare the school level governance members' perceptions. Further inquiry into the Board of Education and Department of Education specifically could help specify where, how, and why communication of arts and physical education policies break down. Ideally, there would be shared governance and transparency among all citizens. This type of perspective engages high-level governance members in the discussions and critical analysis of their decisions. These decisions have a huge impact on our education system. When there is a lack of transparency and access, it becomes more difficult to truly understand the impact of policy and decision making. State level governance members, principals, parents/guardians, and students will tremendously benefit from a better understanding of policy and decision making and how those decisions impact the educational system in Hawai'i.

Second, the current study was conducted only in the context of Hawai'i. Similar studies need to be conducted in the rest of the United States to acquire further understanding of the national phenomenon (an erosion of art, music, and physical education). All other states will have different characteristics, and many states will be much too large to be examined by a single researcher or research team. Groups of school districts that are in geographical proximity could serve as a starting point to investigate this phenomenon in other states. With multiple research teams, a state with more than 150 (like in Colorado) school districts could be much more manageable.

Third, the study was conducted only in one-shot and no longitudinal data were collected. Investigating if this study has or will serve as a treatment or a catalyst for change in policy across the State of Hawai'i for the non-core subject areas would be valuable. Questionnaires or further interviews could track the structure, governance, and policy changes that take place a posteriori. It is important to continue to track and study art, music, and physical education in Hawai'i, before some of these subjects get eradicated from the curriculum. Not only is this follow-up important at the state level, but there have also been Federal changes since the data collection for this study was complete. In 2016, an act was passed and the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA) was born (Jones & Workman, 2016). Within the ESSA act, the emphasis was given to a well-rounded education. The Elementary and Secondary Education Act was also reauthorized and now includes a "well-rounded" education definition that incorporates arts, music, and physical education (Jones & Workman, 2016). The realization that NCLB overemphasized subjects like reading and math are clear, and the national rhetoric is now changing to be more inclusive of all subjects. Considering that education acts constantly change overtime, continuous investigation to understand the impacts of the governance and local education systems are crucial.

Conclusion

The State of Hawai'i is one of the most unique places in the world. The cultural richness from the 'melting pot' of cultures is unparalleled. The rich artistic culture of the Hawai'ian islands provides an immense opportunity to teach and learn art and music skills which helps people transmit their beliefs and culture for the present and future generations. Aspects of dance and other physical activities also assist cultures to pass down culturally relevant skills to the Hawai'i culture-sharing group. Many strengths of the educational structure can be communicated throughout the system to gain better access to and accountability of art, music, and physical education policies that matter. The values of governance members supporting the 'non-core' are clear, and with a better understanding of the educational structure and governance of Hawai'i, there is hope that the state can act more on these values.

Recently, many large educational systems have undergone major changes in their systems, particularly in regards to innovations with governance. A common finding is that systems are moving away from a "compliance" scenario, and are moving towards collaborative leadership. Models like "systemic success" (Prusak et al., 2010) and "inside-out/outside-in" (Darling-Hammond et al., 2006) offer ideas that are neither "top down" nor "bottom up" in nature. Governance, policy, and best practices analysis are critical to the betterment of education. Other best practices in education have been identified in terms of five foundations to student success (Weingarten, 2010). The five foundations include: good teachers supported by good leaders, a good curriculum, and an environment that eliminates barriers to student success, shared responsibility/mutual accountability, and collaboration. By analyzing and conducting qualitative research in this realm, people can have an improved understanding of what works.

Throughout this study examples of continuous change within educational acts, governance, and local education systems were discussed by our participants. Within this environment, it is critical that we continue to examine our individual states and our nation in terms of educational governance and impact. Additionally, from these investigations and review of literature alternative forms of governing will emerge. For example, not only are entire states utilizing alternative forms of governance, but entire nations are rethinking governance as well. In England, the "governance narrative" is being debated, and "decentered" and "asymmetrical network governance" approaches are being used and refined at various levels (Goodwin & Grix, 2011; Grix, 2010). Like Hawai'i's education system, the common pattern in England has been one of a concentration of policy-making within a small number of governance members—amongst the core executives. The dilution of top-down delivery of policy, has led to a "sideways" or decentered approach of governance where a series of networks with a wider variety of interests and perspectives are represented. Asymmetrical network governance searches to "capture the paradox in certain policy sectors, where outward signs of 'governance' are empirically discernible, yet asymmetrical power relations remain the dominant mode of governing" (Goodwin & Grix, 2011, p. 537). The top-down policy delivery method coupled with a difficulty in obtaining participants representative of the entire governance structure demonstrated the challenge of doing this type of research. Even in the face of this challenge, findings from this study, document the importance of the willingness to change governance structures and policy delivery methods to best meet student needs.

References

- Affonso, D. D., Mayberry, L., Shibuya, J. Y., Archambeau, O. G., Correa, M., Deliramich, A. N., & Freuh, B. C. (2010). Cultural context of school communities in rural Hawai'i to inform youth violence prevention. *Journal of School Health*, 80(3), 146-152.
- Aronson, N., Barbeau, R., & Posny, A. (2005). Kansas state department of education: Hope and a sense of possibility in a time of scarcity and despair. In R. Schweitz & K. Martens (Eds.), *Future search in school district change: Connection, community, and results* (p. 267). Lanham, MY: Scarecrow Education.
- Barnhart, R. (2011). RCSI budget cuts art, music, foreign language. Retrieved from. <http://www.13wham.com/news>
- Brandt, E. (2011). School board discusses cuts to art, music, gym in secret. *The Mercury*. Retrieved from <http://www.pottsmmerc.com>
- Burnsed, C. V. (1993). *Classroom teachers's guide to music education*. Springfield, IL: Charles C. Thomas.
- Carlson, S. A., Fulton, J. E., Lee, S. M., Maynard, M., Brown, D. R., Kohl, H. W., III, & Dietz, W. H. (2008). Physical education and academic achievement in elementary school: Data from the early childhood longitudinal study. *American Journal of Public Health*, 98, 721-727.

- Chrispeels, J. H., & Gonzalez, M. (2006). The challenge of systemic change in complex educational systems: A district model to scale up reform. In A. Harris & J. Chrispeels (Eds.), *Improving schools and educational systems: International perspectives*. Oxford, UK: Routledge.
- Coleman, S. (2001, January). Phys-ed classes are out, academics in. *Boston Globe*, p. 29 Retrieved from <http://www.boston.com/globe>
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Darling-Hammond, L., Hightower, A. M., Husbands, J. L., LaFors, J. R., Young, V. M., & Christopher, C. (2006). Building instructional quality: “Inside-out” and “outside-in” perspectives on San Diego’s school reform. In A. Harris & J. Chrispeels (Eds.), *Improving schools and educational systems: International perspectives*. Oxford, UK: Routledge.
- Elmore, R. E., & Sykes, G. (1992). Curriculum policy. In P. W. Jackson (Ed.), *Handbook of research on curriculum* (p. 945). New York, NY: MacMillan Publishing Company.
- Giambo, D. A. (2010). High-stakes testing, high school graduation, and limited English proficient scores: A case study. *American Secondary Education*, 38(2), 44-56.
- Goodwin, M., & Grix, J. (2011). Bringing structures back in: The “governance narrative,” the “decentered approach” and “asymmetrical network governance” in the education and sport policy communities. *Public Administration*, 89(2), 537-556.
- Graham, G., Wilkins, J. L., Westfall, S., Parker, S., Fraser, R., & Tembo, M. (2002). The effects of high-stakes testing on elementary school art, music, and physical education. *Journal of Physical Education Recreation and Dance*, 73(8), 51-54.
- Grauerholz, L. (2001). Teaching holistically to achieve deep learning. *College Teaching*, 49(2), 44-50.
- Grix, J. (2010). The “governance debate” and the study of sport policy. *International Journal of Sport Policy*, 2(2), 159-179.
- Guifoyle, C. (2006). NCLB: Is there life beyond testing? *Educational Leadership*, 64(3), 8-13.
- Hawai’i Arts Alliance. (2008). Pa’ipa’ilima “To acknowledge and applaud important events.” Retrieved from <http://www.hawaiiartsalliance.org/index.php/newsletters/volume/newsletters>
- Hawai’i Board of Education (HIBOE). (2007). State of Hawai’i wellness guidelines. Retrieved from http://doeweb2.k12.hi.us/foodservice/toolkit/wellness_guidelines.htm
- Hawai’i Board of Education (HIBOE). (2010). Minutes from the general business meeting on June 17th, 2010. Retrieved from <http://www2.ed.gov/programs/raceto the top/ phase2-applications/amendments/hawaii.pdf>
- Hawai’i Board of Education (HIBOE). (2011). June 7, 2011 General Business Meeting Testimonies. Retrieved from <http://www.hawaiiboe.net/Meetings/Notices/Documents/06-0711%20GBM/060711%20GBM%20Testimonies.pdf>
- Hawai’i Department of Education (HIDOE). (2006). Superintendent’s Annual Reports. Honolulu, HI: Hawai’i Department of Education.
- Heart, B., & Deschenie, T. (2006). Historical and post-colonial stress in American Indian populations. *Tribal College Journal*, 3, 1.
- Kaomea, J. (2000). A curriculum of aloha? Colonial tourism and tourism in Hawai’i’s elementary textbooks. *Curriculum Inquiry*, 30, 319-344.
- Lounsbury, M. A., McKenzie, T. L., Trost, S. G., & Smith, N. J. (2011). Facilitators and barriers to adopting evidence-based physical education in elementary schools. *Journal of Physical Activity & Health*, 8, S17-S25.
- Malone, H. J. (2008). Educating the whole child: Could community schools hold an answer. *The Education Digest*, 74(2), 6-8.
- Mark, M. L. (1986). *Contemporary music education*. New York, NY: Schirmer Books.
- Marumoto, C. (2007). *Guide to government in Hawai’i* (13th ed.). Retrieved from www.state.hi.us/lrb/
- McFee, J. K., & Degge, R. M. (1977). *Art, culture, and environment: A catalyst for teaching*. Belmont, CA: Wadsworth Publishing.
- Mears, D. (2010). Physical education waivers and young adult activity. *Educator*, 67(2), 1-15.
- Merriam, S.B. (2009). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

- National Center for Education Statistics. (2011). State profiles. Retrieved from <http://nces.ed.gov/nationsreportcard/states/>
- No Child Left Behind Act of 2001, 20 U.S.C. § 6319 (2008).
- Prusak, K. A., Pennington, T., Graser, S. V., Beighle, A., & Morgan, C.F. (2010). Systemic success in physical education: The east valley phenomenon. *Journal of Teaching in Physical Education*, 29, 85-106.
- Quillen, I. (2009). Hawai'i copes with disruption from school furloughs. *Education Week*, 29(10), 17-18.
- Research Making Chance Research Corporation. (2011). Summary of funded race to the top applicants: Science, technology, engineering, and mathematics activities in eleven states and the District of Columbia. Portsmouth, NH: Center on Instruction.
- Robelen, E. (2010). Talk bigger than federal funding for STEM projects. *Education Week*, 29(22), 8-9.
- Saks, J. (1999). High stakes and high anxiety in Virginia-Will your state be next? *The American School Board Journal*, 186(3), 6-7.
- Strauss, A. C., & Corbin, J. (2008). *Basics of qualitative research: Techniques and procedures for developing grounded theory* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Stretcher, B. M., & Barron, S. L. (1999). Quadrennial milestone accountability testing in Kentucky. (CSE Tech. Rep. No. 505). Los Angeles, CA: University of California Center for Research on Evaluation, Standards, and Student Testing.
- Taylor, S. J., & Bogdan, R. (1984). *Introduction to qualitative research methods: The search for meanings*. New York, NY: John Wiley & Sons.
- Tinning, R. (2006). Theoretical orientations in physical education teacher education. In D. Kirk, D. Macdonald, & M. O'Sullivan (Eds.), *The handbook of physical education* (pp. 386-406). London, England: SAGE Publications.
- Tremarche, P., Robinson, E., & Graham, L. (2007). Physical education and its effects on elementary testing results. *Physical Educator*, 64(2), 58-64.
- Trost, S. G., & van der Mars, H. (2010). Why we should not cut P.E. *Health and Learning*, 67(4), 60-65.
- U.S. Department of Education. (2004). Four Pillars of NCLB. Retrieved from <http://www2.ed.gov/nclb/overview/intro/4pillars.html>
- U.S. Department of Education. (2011). Adequate yearly progress. Retrieved from https://answers.ed.gov/app/answers/detail/a_id/6
- Weingarten, R. (2010). Five foundations for student success. In K. Weber (Ed.), *Waiting for "Superman:" How we can save America's failing public schools* (p. 24). New York, NY: Public Affairs.
- Woodside-Jiron, H., & Gehsmann, K. (2009). Peeling back the layers of policy and school reform: Revealing the structural and social complexities within. *International Journal of Disability, Development, and Education*, 56(1), 49-72.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case study research design and methods* (4th ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.